Case 1:15-cr-00333-LTS Document 46 Filed 01/20/17 Page 1 of 6

GCF5aarC 1 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK 2 3 UNITED STATES OF AMERICA, New York, N.Y. 15 Cr. 333 (LTS) 4 V. 5 JOSHUA AARON, 6 Defendant. 7 ----x 8 December 15, 2016 11:10 a.m. 9 10 Before: 11 HON. LAURA TAYLOR SWAIN, 12 District Judge 13 14 **APPEARANCES** 15 PREET BHARARA United States Attorney for the 16 Southern District of New York BY: EUN YOUNG CHOI 17 NOAH D. SOLOWIEJCZYK Assistant United States Attorneys 18 BRAFMAN & ASSOCIATES, P.C. 19 Attorney for Defendant BY: BENJAMIN BRAFMAN 20 JACOB KAPLAN 21 22 23 24 25

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

(Case called)

MS. CHOI: Good morning, your Honor. Eun Young Choi and Noah Solowiejczyk for the government. With us at counsel table is Special Agent Jonathan Luca with the FBI.

AGENT LUCA: Good morning, your Honor.

MS. CHOI: And special Agent, Christopher Rasor with the United States Secret Service.

AGENT RASOR: Good morning.

THE COURT: Good morning, Ms. Choi; Mr. Solowiejczyk.

MR. SOLOWIEJCZYK: Solowiejczyk, your Honor.

THE COURT: Solowiejczyk. I will work on that.

MR. SOLOWIEJCZYK: That was a good effort.

THE COURT: Special Agent Luca and April Special Agent Rasor.

MR. BRAFMAN: Good morning, your Honor. Benjamin Brafman and Jacob Kaplan for Mr. Aaron who is present.

THE COURT: Good morning, Mr. Brafman, Mr. Aaron, and Mr. Kaplan. Please, be seated.

Ms. Choi -- Mr. Brafman, did you want to give me the status?

MR. BRAFMAN: Yes, I would like that very much, your Honor. Thank you.

Your Honor, we understand that the case that Mr. Aaron is involved in has been adjourned to February 2nd at 11:00 a.m., and we would request that we be adjourned to that date as

data watil that data

3

4

5

7

8

9

1011

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

2021

22

23

2425

date until that date.

I just want to indicate to the Court that Mr. Aaron

well and we are prepared to waive speedy trial issues from this

was arraigned yesterday before Magistrate Judge Francis, he entered a plea of not guilty, and we waived a bail application at that time and we are waiving a bail application today but are reserving our right to revisit the issue at some point in the future.

I just want to indicate for the Court that for the past several months Mr. Aaron and his counsel have been working very diligently trying to get him back here. He turned down an offer of asylum in Russia, he waived his extradition, and with the assistant of the government — and I thank them for this — were ultimately able to get him released and he flew back — I think — yesterday, and we are here today. So, it is his first appearance but there will be a time when we intend to revisit is the issue of bail, hopefully if we can on consent, and if not then we will alert your Honor well in advance of the application so that the Court isn't surprised by it.

THE COURT: Thank you.

 $\ensuremath{\mathsf{MR}}.$ $\ensuremath{\mathsf{BRAFMAN}}:$ You are welcome, your Honor.

THE COURT: I appreciate all of that and all of that information.

Mr. Choi, what arrangements have you in place for discovery?

MS. CHOI: Yes, your Honor.

I have spoken with defense counsel. As I think I have represented to the Court previously at court conferences, discovery in this case is voluminous, it involves many terabytes of data. We will ask defense counsel for hard drives, as is the normal course, in order to produce that evidence to him for his review. We can get that process started relatively quickly and I think we will be in a good spot by February with regard to that.

THE COURT: And what are the arrangements for allowing Mr. Aaron to see discovery in the facility?

MS. CHOI: Your Honor, generally speaking, we can work that out with defense counsel or the facility directly. In certain cases they request that they have the capacity to review, in which case we can produce a hard drive to the MDC which is where I think he is presently for his review, but we will work that out with defense counsel. If there are any issues I think we can resolve them without the Court's intervention.

THE COURT: All right. That's always welcome.

Is there anything further that the government believes I should know at this point?

MS. CHOI: No, your Honor.

I think we will reserve any further comment about this. If the Court has any questions, obviously we can answer

them, but if there is a future bail application we will evaluate that when defense counsel brings it to our attention and if can he can't resolve it between the two of us, we will take it to the Court.

THE COURT: So, just to confirm, am I correct in understanding that Mr. Aaron was arraigned as well as presented yesterday?

MS. CHOI: Correct, your Honor.

MR. BRAFMAN: That's correct, your Honor.

THE COURT: Very good, then.

And so we already have I think in place, a speedy trial exclusion to February 2nd, but for completeness, since Mr. Aaron is in this case now, is there request for exclusion?

MS. CHOI: Yes, your Honor. I believe that's right. Under 18 U.S.C. 3161, because he is presently joined with his co-defendants time is already excluded. But, just to complete the loop and in an abundance of caution, the government would ask for an exclusion of time between now and February 2nd in order to allow the government to begin production of discovery to the defense, for the defense to begin its review, and for there to be any preliminary talks with regard to resolution of this case.

MR. BRAFMAN: Your Honor, that would be on consent.

THE COURT: Very well.

The application, on consent, is granted. I find that

the ends of justice served by the granting of an exclusion from 1 2 speedy trial computations for the period from today's date 3 through February 2nd, 2017, weigh the best interests of the public and the defendant in a speedy trial for the reasons 4 5 summarized by Ms. Choi. Accordingly, the time period is 6 excluded prospectively. 7 Is there anything else that we should take up together this morning? 8 9 MS. CHOI: Not from the government, your Honor. 10 you. 11 MR. BRAFMAN: Not from defense, your Honor. 12 very much. 13 THE COURT: Keep well, everyone, and I will look 14 forward to seeing you in February. 15 MR. BRAFMAN: Happy holidays, your Honor. 16 THE COURT: Happy holidays. 17 000 18 19 20 21 22 23 24